



Annual General Meeting 2013

24th August 2013, Adelphi Centre, Glasgow

Attendees

H. Glen President, A.Howie Executive Director, D. Congalton Finance Director, G. Alomenu, L. Barnes, G. Bonner , H. Brechin, T. Brown, I. Brownlee, W. Buchanan, D. Bryson, R. Copland, D. Deary, T. Donohue, A. Gillies, C. Hampton, R. Heathwood, S. Hilton, D. Howie, A. Jelfs, G. Loblely, A. MacQueen, C. MacQueen, D. Marshall, A. McCulloch, L. McCusker, A. McFarlane, C. Milton, S. Milton, R. Montgomery, A. Muir, G. Murphy, C. Pritchett, J. Smith, K. Stewart, D. Wilson, J. Webster, A. White, J. Underwood

Apologies (for proxies received, please see Appendix 2)

J. Edwards, S. Mannion Snr, D. Oswald, P.Woods

Meeting started 11:00

## Minutes

### Minutes of Previous Meeting

- Change wording to read “less keen on Benidorm”
- Motion 2, needs to be clarified that SJCAET is an Independent body

Proposer – George Murphy      Seconder Ken Stewart

## Reports from Directors

### 1. President

- Report was given orally with emphasis on developing a regional style with respect to Junior chess to give greater autonomy.

### 2. Finance Director

- Still trying to secure a source of funding for Chess Scotland.
- Funding for next year will give priority to the Commonwealth over the Olympiad however we are hoping the Commonwealth will be cost neutral.
- SJCAET will be approached to see if there is any assistance for the Glorney
- Delay in Audited Accounts, should be available for next Council Meeting



### 3. Technical Director – Ken Stewart

- Due to delay in FIDE confirming the new Rules for Chess, the new rules book will be produced April/May 2014

### 4. Grading Officer – Douglas Bryson

- We are unable to FIDE rate Spens and Richardson due to the FIDE rules on having a licenced arbiter present. Only way it could be done would be to have a licence non playing captain on each side.

### 5. Membership Secretary – Dick Heathwood

- Statistics are published every month and new members are welcomed on the Chess Scotland Website.
- The list of current members published on the website continues to be updated regularly, typically once or more often per week.

### 6. Scottish Championship Director – Alex McFarlane

- Commonwealth is progressing well. Still looking to confirm a venue as Strathclyde are looking for 12K for a venue
- Provisional dates are 30<sup>th</sup> June – 8<sup>th</sup> July
- Having real issues finding a sponsor so would like help from the Marketing Director in finding and obtaining a sponsor

### 7. Executive Director / Fide Delegate

- Had meetings with MSP over Chess in Schools and funding for Commonwealth
- Working with Alex on the Commonwealth
- Aiming to make a decision on our candidate for the FIDE and ECU elections at the nearest Council meeting.

### 8. Standards Committee – Dick Heathwood

- The Standard Committee respects confidentiality. Having said that if someone involved with a complaint decides to “go public” by releasing information even on what they assume is a limited basis, identities cannot be protected beyond that point. The wishes that people are named and shamed would open up the organization to potential legal challenge
- There is a procedure in place for monitoring someone through a suspension and for considering any application for reinstatement



- It was suggested that the Appeals Board should report to the AGM on the appeals they had considered during the year

### **Election of Office Bearers**

- A point of order was raised stating that the Executive Director, Andy Howie was in fact not a member of Chess Scotland when the nominations were made. This prevents him from nominating someone and holding office.
- David Congalton pointed out that Andy had in fact paid his membership twice. He was paying for something in lieu of membership and also taking out a membership on top of that
- We are trying a new way of paying for membership and could not start it until the AGM agreed to it. It was agreed prior between the President, Treasurer and Membership Secretary that once the AGM were informed of what we were trying, then we could start. Given that the money paid in would exceed Patron membership for a year then Andy was considered to be a member.

President (key points from responses from floor questions)

Hamish Glen, Proposer Alex McFarlane Seconder Andy Howie

- Chess Scotland has to find a way to move forward. One of the key areas would be to sort out the noticeboard which is a source of many of the issues seen. Reconciliation can only work if both sides go into it wanting it to work.
- We need to look bringing in a time bar for people joining Chess Scotland so they can't join the night before an AGM and get a vote

Stephen Hilton, Proposer Ian Brownlee Seconder Chris Hampton

- Chess Scotland need to take a look at itself and heal the internal fighting. A neutral looking in would be horrified at what they saw
- There has to be transparency in all actions
- Stepped down from Home Director as made a decision that he felt put him in a catch 22 situation. Felt he had made a bad mistake and so the honorable thing to do was to resign

Vote Hamish 166, Stephen 28



Executive Director

Andy Howie, Proposer Hamish Glen, Seconder Ian Brownlee

- Looking to try and get more Moderators for the noticeboard so he can concentrate on the administration side of it

Elected Nem con

Finance Director

David Congalton, Proposer Hamish Glen, Seconder Andy Howie

- Alternative sources of funding are being considered however care is being taken to make sure that not crossing into the Marketing Directors remit

Elected Nem con

Home Director Junior

David Deary, proposer David Congalton, seconder Iain Fraser

- Wants to work with an open door policy to try and bring the Junior Organisations together
- Continuing with the current suite of tournaments but would like to reintroduce the Boys Championships and Scottish Schools
- Looking to help to forge links into Schools to promote Secondary Schools Chess
- Request for the Law Society to be revisited

Elected Nem con

International Director

Andy Muir, proposer Hamish Glen, seconder Andy Howie

- Concerns raised about some of the noticeboard postings that were uncomplimentary to other Directors
- Looking to carry forward the underspend in the budget to offset the cost of the Olympiad

Vote 34 for 93 against

#### International Director Junior

Calum MacQueen, proposer Hugh Brechin, seconder Sean Milton

- Fan of online coaching and feels it is beneficial
- Want to improve the level of our squads and get better performances when we are abroad.
- Question was asked on what is charged for online coaching, 10 pounds per hour.
- List of online coaches to be passed on to President and Exec Director
- Can we promote British and get more of our better juniors there

Elected by overwhelming majority

#### Schools Director

June Underwood, proposer David Oswald, seconder Calum MacQueen

- Looking to continue the work of predecessor and work closely with other two junior Directors
- Wants a regional network to assist Juniors with disabilities

Elected Nem con

#### Technical Director

Ken Stewart, proposer Hamish Glen, Seconder Andy Howie

- Very successful Arbiters course run in Ayrshire
- Appealing for more Arbiters

Elected Nem con

#### Marketing Director

Jonathan Edwards, proposer Hugh Brechin, seconder Andy Howie

- Managed to get Sponsorship for Scottish Blitz for last two years. Hoping to bring that experience to Chess Scotland



Due to time constraints, the remaining two posts were considered en bloc

Scottish Championship Director

Alex McFarlane, proposed Andy Howie, seconded Hamish Glen

FIDE/ECU Director

Andy Howie, proposed Hamish Glen, seconded Ian Brownlee

Both elected Nem com.

The AGM then broke from 13:35 to 13:55 for refreshments

4 Representatives of clubs and schools

The following were nominated (the first 4 were elected)

Stewarton Chess Club – 20 votes

East Kilbride Chess Club – 17 votes

Pentland Hills Chess Club – 15 votes

Smithycroft Secondary – 13 votes

St Peters, Edinburgh – 9 votes

2 representatives of registered congresses

Lothian Congress, Dundee Congress



www.ChessScotland.com  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

4 Individuals (there must be a junior and a female)

Daniel Deary,

Lyndsey Shovlin

Douglas Bryson

Steve Mannion Jr

Unfilled positions

Home Director

2 candidates proposed from the floor.

Keith Rose

Andy Muir

Vote Keith 30 Andy 10

Customer Services Director

No candidate

International Director

Andy Muir was renominated by Stephen Hilton and seconded by Ian Brownlee

- Andy pledged to get along better with the Directors and be mindful of his postings on the noticeboard

Vote for 52 against 31



## Auditor

Accountants Plus, proposed Derek Howie, seconded Stephen Hilton

Elected Nem con

## Motions

Motions carried unless noted

1.1, 2.1, 2.2a, 2.2b and 2.5 were considered together

- Working party consisting of Hamish, Andy, David C and three others to consider motions as part of constitutional reform
- Notice to be placed on CS Website for notes of interest for the working party
- Recommendations to be presented first to Council then an EGM

1.2 & 2.5 Selection Procedures

- AGM elects International Junior Director who determines the selection policy
- No further need to go through Council or AGM as is down to the IJD to determine policy

1.3 Changes to Standards Committee Operating Procedure

- Disagreement on point 5 as panel must be reconstituted to prevent same people. Legal advice was taken on this point and as it is correct as in motion.
- Points 7 – 13, changes have been made to correct wording
- Points 14 – 20, suggestion made but not adopted that Operating Procedures should be changed so that no Director is on the committee. Proposed without supporting argument and not adopted that the automatic ban should also be extended to paid official. Point was made that there is no paid official on the Standards Committee

2.9 Noticeboard

- Discussion on whether we should dissolve the link with the noticeboard as has been done with the ECF.
- Moderators should have more powers
- Should it remain a mixed model?
- Should it be for Chess Scotland Members only?
- Should it be open to all?



## Voting

Mixed – Overwhelming

Open to all – 3

Closed to CS Members - 0

## 2.11 Conduct of Office Bearers

- Was considered to be an excellent motion
- There needs to be some consequences for failure to follow the guidelines
- AGM decided this should be considered by the Constitutional Working Party

## 2.4 Working Party on Junior Chess

- All regional Junior reps come together with Junior Home Director as chair
- Report findings and recommendation to AGM & Council

## 2.7 PVG Guidelines

Withdrawn by proposer

## 2.3(a) Dates of AGM

- AGM happy with dates and times of the AGM and there is no appetite to change

Disallowed motions.

A statement was read out on behalf of Steve Mannion Snr explaining why he agreed with the motions being disallowed and giving some of the background to the decisions that were made in the incident.

Meeting ended 16:03. Continuation set for the next council meeting which should be in November, calendar permitting.



Continuation of Annual General Meeting 2013

11th January 2014, Adelphi Centre, Glasgow

#### Attendees

H. Glen President, A. Howie Executive Director, D. Congalton Finance Director, G. Alomenu, A. Borwell, I. Brownlee, D. Bryson, Daniel Deary, David Deary, R. Heathwood, D. Howie, A. McCulloch, L. McCusker, S. Milton, R. Montgomery, A. Muir, G. Murphy, K. Stewart, P. Thomas, A. White, G. Lobley

#### Apologies

L. Barnes, C. Hampton, S. Hilton, C. MacQueen, S. Manion Snr, A. McFarlane, K. Rose, L. Shovlin, J. Webster,

Meeting started 10:30

#### Minutes

#### Motions

Motions carried unless noted

Discussion on use of proxies at meeting

- The meeting asked that proxy votes should not be cast, where considered inappropriate.

2.3b Scrapping of fee for Standards Committee

- Fee is a deterrent for frivolous claims
- Fee is refunded if complaint is merited
- Argument against is it goes against natural justice

Motion defeated 6-9 (Dick Heathwood requested it be noted that he abstained from voting)



## 2.6 Formation of a working party to look at remote chess

- Players from remote areas of Scotland facing large costs to attend events which is putting them off.
- Could be good for getting more Schools back into chess and the disabled
- Other countries have looked at this but been unsuccessful
- Group formed consisting of Sean Milton, David Congalton, Andy Howie, Stephen Hilton, Andy McCulloch, Ian Brownlee and Gilbert Alomenu

## 2.8 Progress report from PVG Sub Committee

- Met once and are about half way through the suggestions
- Report will be published when completed. Hoping for next council or AGM

## 2.10 Junior Events

Withdrawn at request of Proposer

### **AOCB**

#### Disallowed Motions from August 2013 AGM

- It does not appear that Chess Scotland has a policy of monitoring someone to make sure they follow through when suspended. Standards Committee made a decision but we don't seem to be following it through as the person involved is still getting involved with Juniors and Junior decisions
- Chess Scotland has worked within the parameters of the decision from the Standards Committee. What we do have to do is to give the Standard Committee real power so it can act when people don't follow what they are supposed to do. The person referred to has not undertaken regulated work under Chess Scotland since suspension.
- The person involved has never been publically named. Chess Scotland have a duty of care to inform people he was not allowed to work with kids. It was never reported to Disclosure Scotland
- People come on and off the list for all sorts of reasons. If CS were to say that you would never be a Coach / Arbiter again, this would be a different process from the routine advice of additions and removals. The relevant authorities would then investigate the circumstances (A percentage of referrals are dismissed as being motivated by malice.) If the Government Body's (Disclosure Scotland) investigations concluded that the individual was unsuitable to work with children (or with protected adults as the case may be) every person with interest would be notified



- The President of Chess Scotland does not have the right to determine what can and can't be put on the agenda.
- The Agenda has to be checked and ratified before published as we can't let just anything there. All motions have to be competent and not personal. In this case the motions were just that! The President has the right to make sure the meeting runs smoothly.
- The motions were read out and after a short discussion, the meeting voted on whether the President was correct in blocking the motions

Ratified as CS cannot simply allow any motion put forward to automatically appear on the agenda 14-8

The meeting was then asked if we can allow new business since the start of the AGM in August

For 13 against 6

#### **New Business**

##### Olympiad Budget

- We have a budget of about 5K. Any excess will have to be approved by council

##### Constitutional Working Party

- Names should be appearing shortly on the CS website. Those not successful will be told before hand

##### Chaperone List

- Chaperones are people who are not active players who are happy to give up their time looking after children at events. Really aimed at the non chess player. It is not a way of remaining a CS Volunteer and not paying the membership fee

Meeting ended 12:30



## **Appendix 1.**

Statement to the AGM by Steve Mannion Snr.

I feel very concerned over the ongoing and current harassment of a former Chess Scotland official and the related, continuing criticism of the Standards Committee and Chess Scotland.

In fact, my concern is sufficiently strong that I would recommend that the AGM give themselves pause for thought and consider the following facts. I speak out as the person who investigated the original complaint which contained three separate allegations (all from the same person and directed against one other Chess Scotland official). As a result of my investigations, I found two of the complaints unsubstantiated and referred a third to the Standards Committee. The substantial evidence I had collated from the complainer and many witnesses that I contacted who were all at the event (Maribor in Slovenia) was passed on to the committee. They upheld the complaint and offered recommendations with a view to preventing a recurrence in future circumstances. In spite of the finding in favour of the Complainer an appeal was made against the decision of the Standards Committee. Although I am Convener of the Appeal Board, I took no part in the consideration of the five page, over two thousand word Appeal. That Board was chaired by an eminent and experienced Tribunal judge and they rejected the appeal.

I can categorically state that any suggestion of alcohol consumption by the official was not mentioned to me in my several interviews and conversations with the complainer in November/December 2012 and in January 2013. Equally, none of various witnesses that I interviewed expressed any comment that alcohol consumption was in any way relevant to the complaint. It was not until after the decisions of the Standard Committee and the Appeal Board that alcohol consumption was first mentioned by the complainer, some four months plus after the event. At that point I revisited the evidence and made further inquiry and found no evidence to substantiate the claim.

What this AGM does with this information is for them to decide but if this matter ends up in court, as it could do, then I shall be prepared to give evidence based on my enquiries and what the witnesses who were in Slovenia told me.

I regret that I cannot be with you to deliver this message personally but long before this date was agreed for the AGM I had another long standing engagement which I intimated.



[www.ChessScotland.com](http://www.ChessScotland.com)  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

Steve Mannion Senior,  
PVG Lead Signatory,  
Chess Scotland

August 2013



## Appendix 2 – List of proxies

Proxies were received from the following people, Leagues and Clubs

Andrew Gillies	Zak Roy	Keith Aitchison
Craig Gillies	Daniel Deary	Leonie O'Connor
Darren Gillies	Elliot Frew	Lindsay Ridland
Jake Sanger	Iain Fraser	Liz Sams
Mark Sanger	Ian Robertson	Nicholas West
Chess Arbiters Association	John Blake	Norman Skillen
Roland Fraser	Matthew Turner	Paul R Girdwood
Giffnock CC	Pat McGovern	Pentland Hills CC
Iain Cambell	Stephen Taylor	Raj Bhopal
Mike Mitchell	Broden Aitken	Shaughan Harward
Neil Thomson	Colin Howie	Steve Mannion Snr
Phil Giulian	Simon Bate	Stuart McKinney
Rosie Giulian	Susan Howie	Terry E Purkins
Tony Floros	Adam Walkowiak	Tony Dempsey
Alison Smith	Alan Armstrong	Trevor Davies
Andrew Green	Alan Grant	Vipin Zamvar
Andrew McQueen	Alastair Dawson	Walter Pearson
Stuart McQueen	Bill Platts	Adam Bremner
Aidan Shafi	Bryan McClement	Alex Bisset
Ali Roy	Callum Watt	Alex Stewart
Ann Roy	Charles Nisbet	David Burke
Anna Milton	Chris Donkin	David Grant
Carl Milton	Chris J Morrison	David Smith
Charlie Roy	Dave J Taylor	Duncan Grassie
Daniel Koehn	Douglas I McKerracher	Hamish Olson
Declan Shafi	Douglas McKinnon	Ian Grieve
John Shades	Edwin Spencer	Jeremy Mitchell
Judy Milton	Elaine Bamber	Joy Durno
Kai Pannwitz	George Livie	Robert Rough
Len Weir	George Neave	Steve Sawaryn
Lennart Koehn	Gerry Brown	Alasdair Maxwell
Lisa McLennan	Hugh S Flockhart	Alastair McIntyre
Marie Shafi	Iain Mackintosh	Chris Perkin
Paul Shafi	Ian Marks	David Reid
Robin Moore	James D Crerar	Gerard Blake
Robin Templeton	Jim Wallace	Iain Swan
Sean Milton	John Gibson	Clement Sreeves



[www.ChessScotland.com](http://www.ChessScotland.com)  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

David Oswald  
David Robertson  
Graeme Kafka  
Jonathan Edwards  
Neil Berry  
Andrew McCusker  
Andrew McMillan  
Arthur Mulholland  
Bernard Airlie  
Bernard Cassidy  
Daniel Thomas  
James Burns

Jonathan Kent  
Kirsty McCusker  
Morven Petrie  
Stuart Gray  
Tina Christian  
Hamilton CC  
Matthew Thomas  
Chris King  
Craig Pritchett  
Douglas Harvey  
Ed Ferry  
George Pyrich

Graham Morrison  
Lara Barnes  
Mac McKenzie  
Martain Gourlay  
Paul Maiolani  
Paul Motwani  
Roddy McKay  
Stephen Burns Mannion  
Kelsey Hulme  
Lauren Hulme