



## Minutes of Annual General Meeting 27/08/2011

Location: Adelphi Centre, 12 Commercial Road, Glasgow, G5 0PQ

Time: 12:00

Attendees : Michael Hanley (Chair) (MH), IM Douglas Bryson (DB), Derek Howie (DH), IA Alex McFarlane (AM), Donald Wilson (DW), Paul MacDonald (PM), Christopher Hampton (CH), Stephen Hamilton (SH), John McNicoll (JM), Andy Howie (AH), Richard Heathwood (RH), IA Ken Stewart (KS), George Murphy (GM), GM Matthew Turner (MT), David Congalton (DC), Paul Blair (PB), Mac McKenzie (MM)

### Minutes

#### 1. Apologies for absence

Apologies were received from IA Lara Barnes, Stuart Lampard, Graeme Forbes, IM Andrew Muir, Phil Thomas, Jacqui Thomas Stephen Hilton, John Montgomery, Steve Mannion Snr and Trevor Davies

#### 2 Minutes of last AGM and matters arising therefrom

AH noted a correction to be applied from John Montgomery.

KS asked to clarify section "DW confirmed it was himself and John Glendinning who had attended in 2007 when it had been agreed to change the residency rules for the national championships" to read as British Championships as it can be taken as any of the current national championships we have.

Minutes proposed DW, seconded PM carried *Nem Con*

#### 3 Approval of Annual Report, including accounts for year ending 30 April 2011

DH asked for Halkadiki to refer to the Worlds and not the Euros in the IJD report

Reports proposed GM, seconded AM carried *Nem Con*

#### 4 Elections:

AH Stated that as in the previous year, both MH and himself thought that all office holders had done an excellent job and as such they were prepared to nominate and second anyone who wanted to continue. As a result, all positions were nominated by MH and Seconded by AH unless stated

President: Michael Hanley

Nominated Phil Thomas Seconded Jacqui Thomas

Elected *Nem Con*.



[www.ChessScotland.com](http://www.ChessScotland.com)  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

Honorary President: Lord Kirkwood

MH approached Lord Kirkwood when he attended the Scottish and he agreed to be the Honorary President. Lord Kirkwood had in the past, played for the Glorney team.

Elected Nem Con.

Executive Director: Andy Howie

AH stated that he was delighted to the response he has had to his “rant” at the previous AGM. There has been an increase in the number of people volunteering and we have seen several new congresses start.

Elected Nem Con.

Finance Director: Mac McKenzie

Elected Nem Con.

Schools Development Director: Graeme Forbes

DH asked what the role entails

AH replied that it is the Director who liases with the Schools. We are looking for more activity from Secondary schools and that should be a focus.

DH noted that he hoped that that would not be at the expense of Primary Schools

AH agreed that it would not

Elected Nem Con.

Home Chess Director (Open): Stephen Hilton

Elected Nem Con.

Home Chess Director (Junior): No nomination received  
Opened to the floor

Donald Wilson agreed to take on the role. Proposed MH, Seconded AH

Elected Nem Con.

Customer Services Director No nomination received

International Director (Open) IM Andy Muir

Elected Nem Con.



www.ChessScotland.com  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

International Director (Junior) No nomination received

AH advised that Stephen Hilton has volunteered if no one was forthcoming. PM stated that he was interested in the role and give the AGM his background. PM asked if he would be treading on Stephen's toes by volunteering,

AH advised that Stephen had given him instruction that only if there was no volunteer

DH asked if there would still be a selection committee and if so would the names be publicised as in the past

PM confirmed that he would be and would be seeking a meeting with Phil and Jacqui to ensure a smooth handover.

Proposed DH Seconded AM

Elected Nem Con.

Marketing Director No nomination received

AH opened to floor. AM suggested that the position be held open until AOCB in lieu of the announcements there. Chair agreed.

Technical Director IA Ken Stewart

KS revealed that he was now entering his 35<sup>th</sup> year as a Director of Chess Scotland.

AH asked if there had been much interest in the Arbiters Course this year

KS advised that there had been little and he felt that we needed to get the revamp completed this year to bring more people in.

Elected Nem Con.

Scottish Championships Director IA Alex McFarlane.

AM advised that he was going to need people to sit on the committee.

RH confirmed he would continue as entries secretary and asked what else AM required

AM stated, Live boards, publicity, accommodation etc.

Elected Nem Con.



www.ChessScotland.com  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

FIDE/ECU delegate Andy Howie

AH advised that this had been his busiest year in this role with the elections for FIDE and ECU presidents.

RH asked what the role entailed.

AH replied it was mainly acting as CS contact for ECU and FIDE, building relationships and answering any queries that arise, for example, around visas.

Elected Nem Con.

Auditor Karen Clark CA

Elected Nem Con.

Webmaster Andrew McHarg

Proposed IM Douglas Bryson, Seconded Andy Howie

DB advised that due to the changes and continual upgrades that Andrew McHarg has been doing, it would make more sense if he was to step down and allow Andrew to continue.

DB stated that the work that has been done has been at minimal cost and that Andrew would be looking for remuneration for work that he is doing. All costs will be agreed in advance with the board.

AH proposed a vote of thanks for the work that DB has done over the last decade on the website.

Elected Nem Con.

Four representatives of Club Members, at least one of which must be a school

Kirkhill Primary School  
Stewarton Chess Club  
Pentland Hills Chess Club  
East Kilbride Chess Club

Proposed CH Seconded PM

Elected Nem Con.



www.ChessScotland.com  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

Two representatives of registered congresses

Lothians  
Prestwick

Proposed JM seconded DH

Elected Nem Con.

Four individual members, one of whom must be female and one under age 18.

Paul Blair  
Jacqui Thomas  
Peter Devenny  
IM Douglas Bryson

Proposed MH seconded DH

Elected Nem Con.

## 5. Motions raised by members

### 5.1 Ayrshire Chess Association Motion on Standards Committee

For complete details of the motion, please refer to the motions on the agenda on the Chess Scotland Webpage

AH read out an email he had received from Trevor Davies

“Re: John Montgomery (Ayrshire) motions to the AGM relating to the Standards Code.

Before addressing these motions, I’d like to respond to his initial remarks.

First, I don’t accept that there was much “contention” about the introduction of the Standards Code: its introduction was welcomed by Council, overwhelmingly approved at AGM and re-affirmed once again, as I understand it, overwhelmingly at a subsequent Council - including all League reps, bar Ayrshire?

The primary reason for introducing the Code was to prevent any repeat of the several problems which caused damage to chess in Scotland (and considerable hurt to individuals) some years back. The negative effects are still with us. The existence of the Code may have helped to maintain the current good climate but it is definitely optimistic to suppose we will never have to face such problems again. I think it would be very unwise to effectively scrap the Code – which is exactly the effect of the first motion to the AGM.

With regard to my own position, as you know I have not been active in chess, in any capacity, for the last eighteen months or so. I have also considered tendering my resignation as Convenor of the Standards Committee. However, I am hopeful that this year (the last year of my 3-year term) that I will be able to make a greater



contribution (including tying up some loose ends in the Code, suggested by members of the Committee and others) than hitherto. The Committee has not formally met but there has been useful email and telephone communication in regard to several matters, including the motions to AGM. To avoid pointless inconvenience, the Committee will bring forward a proposal to relax its current standing orders re reporting/frequency of meetings for any year when no Panel is convened.

The motions:

1. Unless previously agreed, the Committee has no jurisdiction over any events not organised by CS but which are run under the auspices of other chess organisations or tournament directors.

It's hard to know where to start – this is so badly drafted as to be meaningless.

- (a) The committee has jurisdiction over people (as listed in this section) - not events.
- (b) What are the "events organised by CS". ? The "Scottish" and .....?.
- (c) Agreed by whom? On what authority?

Of course the intention is obvious: the proposer does not want the Standards Code to apply to any person taking part, or is in any way involved, in any of his events. The proposer, I'm sure, has excellent standards of his own. In that case, there is no problem: the Code makes it abundantly clear that it will not interfere where such standards exist.

However, what happens if another organizer (who is, by default, exempted from the Code) has poor standards? What if children are involved? Will parents or our government sponsors accept that the governing chess organisation (advertising events/grading results/providing arbiters and their training) can wash its hands of all responsibility if anything goes wrong? What happens when say a CS arbiter is verbally abused at an "exempt" event ? Or the reverse?

In place of this motion, I would have fractionally more sympathy with a preface to the Code which might begin as follows:

On the request of X, Y and Z, Chess Scotland has agreed that any and all persons taking part in  
(or are associated with) any chess event organized by the above –named are exempted from the jurisdiction of Chess Scotland and, specifically, its Standards Code provided that all such persons are informed of this exemption in writing (i.e., on the event entry form) and a prominent notice to that effect is posted at the venue itself, .....

Having drawn up a watertight disclaimer (which would have to cover a lot more ground than the above), CS would likely have to, on legal grounds, completely withdraw all support (grading/ advertising/arbiters etc) from such events.

2. "received within ten days"

Accepted: no objection to this: setting a time limit on payment. However the Committee would wish to suggest a better form of words than this in due course.

3. strike out "normally"

Rejected : as explained before, a complainant may be faced with endless time-wasting obstacles and therefore in such cases a complainant must be afforded the



opportunity to take the matter to the Committee before all “direct routes” have been exhausted.

4. Various wording revisions under “ 7. Panel Procedures” and “9. Judgements”  
For analogous reasons to the above, the Panel needs to retain flexibility to do its job properly in all circumstances. (The Panel is already bound by its guiding principles to uphold the highest standards of integrity etc in exercising that discretion). Hence, all but the following amendments are rejected.

The notice of the Hearing will contain the substance of the complaint.

(This is the implied intention of the original sentence, i.e., where the original complaint is unsatisfactory in some way (e.g., inflammatory/libellous etc) ). Good form of words.

(re adjournments ) 14 days (instead of 7).

Amendment to rest of sentence rejected.

5. “Appeals must be made ... within 42 days”

Rejected – this is far too long and drags out the process for no obvious purpose. However, I would support an amendment .... normally within 7 days.  
(The Committee should look into this in due course).

Trevor Davies”

KS also advised that he had had a call from Steve Mannion Snr and had concerns as to whether the motion may permit a breach of the Child Protection Policy for Chess Scotland. It was suggested that any audit by the Scottish Government that we subsequently had would not be looked at favourably with the motion in place.

There then followed a debate on how best to deal with the new information. The Ayrshire representatives had sufficient votes to force the issue through should they have chosen. Instead, after a suggestion from GM to postpone to council, was an agreement to postpone the motion for a period of no greater than 3 months to allow AH to get the parties together to sort out the difficulties. Within this 3 month period there will be an EGM to be held on a Sunday.

The motion has to be presented within 3 weeks of the EGM and will be published immediately to allow comment.

AH felt that this had dragged on long enough and he was not prepared to wait another year to sort this out.

The board recognised that the continuing lack of consensus was giving rise to frustration and agreed that, with goodwill, it should be possible to achieve an agreed way forward.

Proposal to Adjourn for a maximum of 3 months was approved by a majority



www.ChessScotland.com  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

Motion 2 (Proposed by Andy Howie, Seconded by Michael Hanley)

The position of Honorary President shall be exempt from annual elections and will be held until either the holder wishes to resign or the AGM recommends that there is a change.

DH proposed an amendment to the motion setting the maximum term before review as 5 years. CH seconded the amendment

Amendment was defeated 15-2

Motion was carried

Motion 3 (Proposed by Andrew Muir, Seconded by Jacqui Thomas)

A new category of Chess Scotland member shall be created. Members of this category will be entitled to have the code SCO in the FIDE rating list and to use the Scottish flag. They will not be entitled to play for Scottish teams and not be entitled to obtain the title of Scottish champion. Members shall come under this category at the discretion of the management board.

After a discussion, it was agreed that the motion was over complex and that a simpler solution should be sought. AH has agreed to draft a motion to cover this for the upcoming EGM

Motion overwhelmingly rejected

Motion 4 (Proposed by: David Deary Seconded by: Andrew McHarg)

1. That the following revisions are made to the Chess Scotland Constitution to ensure that communication with members is effective going forward. All additions are marked in red and underlined.

### **13 ANNUAL GENERAL MEETING (AGM)**

**13.4** The Executive Director shall give each member six weeks notice of the place, date and hour of the Annual General Meeting, but such meeting will not be invalidated should any member not receive advice of the meeting. It shall be deemed sufficient to publish these details on the Chess Scotland internet site and to contact all members by email (or in writing if no email address is available).

**13.7** The Executive Director shall publish all nominations for elections and proposals for consideration at least two weeks before the meeting. It shall be deemed sufficient to publish these details on the Chess Scotland internet site and to contact all members by email (or in writing if no email address is available).

### **14 SPECIAL GENERAL MEETING (SGM)**





www.ChessScotland.com  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

**14.6** The Executive Director shall give two weeks notice to members of the holding of a Special General Meeting, but such a meeting will not be invalidated should any member not receive advice of the meeting. It shall be deemed sufficient to publish these details on the Chess Scotland internet site and to contact all members by email (or in writing if no email address is available). The notice of the meeting shall include a statement of the purpose of the meeting and include details of the motion(s) to be voted on.

Prior to the Meeting RH had advised the chair of the costs involved in arranging a paper distribution to around 100 members where no email address was known. He suggested that the AGM would want to take account of the costs involved before reaching a decision.

AGM felt, as had been tried with this AGM, that the sending of reports had helped and were happy for this to continue

Motion was amended to read “and where possible to contact all member by e-mail”  
Proposed AMc Seconded MM

Amendment was carried Nem. Con.

6. Any Other Competent Business

6.1 Scottish Championship

AM Read the following

### **“Scottish Championships 2012**

Chess Scotland is pleased to announce that the 2012 Scottish Championships will be greatly enhanced thanks to the support of an anonymous benefactor.

This person wishes to remain unknown and we will honour that request. I am not able to say how much the arrangement is for, other than it is a significant amount which should enable a large number of titled players to take part. The ambitious target figure is to have 10 GMs and 10 IMs competing and a total field of at least 80 players.

I hope to be able to confirm dates and a venue within the next few weeks. I will then contact our titled players with offers of ‘conditions’. Thereafter other titled players will be approached.

The provisional dates are 7th-15th July, 2012. (It may be the week before.)

With some luck we will be able to put on an event to rival, if not better, Edinburgh 2009.



www.ChessScotland.com  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

There is the potential for this deal to be extended to three years. It also means that we can now make a realistic bid for the 2014 Commonwealth Championships.

The Scottish Championships website will go on line at 15:00

As part of the sponsorship deal Chess Scotland will be able to get 8 sensory boards. However, whilst this money can be used initially it must be returned to the Scottish Championship fund. This does allow us to get the boards and start the process of live games.”

The AGM unanimously passed a vote of thanks to benefactor. Anyone else wishing their appreciation to be recorded should contact

## 6.2 Live boards fees

AH asked for guidance on how the congresses should be charged for the use of the live boards.

4 proposals were put forward

- Fixed fee of £50
- Donation
- Donation with a minimum of £50
- £1 per entrant in the congress

The AGM felt it would be best for the Management board to decide but indicated they would like to see a donation idea for the first year.

## 6.3 U12 Youth Squad

Phil Thomas has asked if he can form an U12 Youth Squad to work with them with the view to bringing them on for international tournaments.

RH asked what impact this would have on the budget.

MM advised it would have none, as any costs would have to go through the IJD.

AGM was happy to allow this idea

## 6.4 2012 Scottish Champion given an automatic place in the Olympiad Squad

Andy Muir suggested that the Scottish Champion 2012 be given an automatic place in the Olympiad team for Turkey

Suggestion was overwhelmingly rejected by the AGM



www.ChessScotland.com  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

#### 6.5 Noticeboard

RH asked if it was possible to restrict access to members only as he was fed up of non members endlessly pontificating on Chess Scotland Business.

AH & DB advised there would be a new noticeboard and if wanted we could set up a members only section. We should, however, at all times have a public section.

AGM agreed to keep the status quo but monitor the noticeboard and revisit if necessary.

#### 6.6 Scottish Lightning Championships

AH passed on from East Kilbride Chess Club, that they would be interested to host the Scottish individual Lightning Championships.

AM asked if it could be held off for now in light of the announcement for the Scottish Championships as they are looking at that as part of a sponsorship idea.

#### 6.7 Complaint about SJCAET website

Phil Thomas brought to light an issue with the SJCAET website that he has not been able to get the full information on.

PM has agreed to take this on and will report to Council of his findings

#### 6.8 Disability Officers Report

CH sent a report in a few days prior to the AGM. AH agreed to have it added to the reports and asked if CH could submit one next year at the same time as the Directors

#### 6.9 Matthew Turner nationality transfer

After Motion 3 was rejected and AH agreed that he would put a motion up at the EGM for ratification, we still had to look at what we should do with MT's request for transfer.

AH outlined what his motion would be, using Grandparents for qualification in lines with all other sports.

MT advised that he had communication from the ECF that they would not be looking for compensation for him to transfer.

AH proposed that we process the transfer now and not leave MT stateless for another 3 months. This was seconded by PB and carried with a majority.



www.ChessScotland.com  
**CHESS SCOTLAND**

#### 10. Marketing Director

This was postponed until after the Scottish announcement. Paul Blair advised that he would be interested in the position and outlined some of the ideas that he had. He revealed that he had a degree in marketing.

Nominated MH Seconded AM Elected Nem. Com.

#### 11. Recognition of achievements

PM proposed that the AGM congratulate both IA Alex McFarlane for being selected for the candidates match and also Stephen Taylor for his MBE in the recent Honours list.

AGM was in full agreement

#### 12. Questions on Grant from the Noticeboard

MM explained more about the grant on the back of questions that have been asked on the noticeboard.

The grant is to support the Admin costs for the organisation. The amount of grant has remained unchanged for five years now although increases have been requested.

DB asked if this information can be passed on to him and it will be put on the website

#### 13. Budget on the website

DB explained that due to an error, the budget was not displaying on the website. This has since been fixed.

Meeting ended 15:15